

1 Harry Shulman, Esq. (SBN 209908)

2 **SHULMAN LAW**

3 44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3830

4 San Francisco, California 94104

5 Telephone: (415) 901-0505

Facsimile: (866) 422-4859

5 [harry@shulmanlawfirm.com](mailto:harry@shulmanlawfirm.com)

6 Counsel for Plaintiffs

7 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**

8 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

10 **ANTHONY PETRU and MARCUS MATHIS,  
11 Individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated,**

Case No. 3:11-CV-03892 EMC

CLASS ACTION

12 Plaintiffs,

13 v.

15 **APPLE INC.; HACHETTE BOOK GROUP,  
16 INC.; HARPERCOLLINS PUBLISHERS,  
17 INC.; MACMILLAN PUBLISHERS, INC.;  
PENGUIN GROUP (USA) INC.; and SIMON  
AND SCHUSTER, INC.**

18 Defendants.

19 **EUGENIA RUANE-GONZALES, and all  
20 others similarly situated,**

Case No. 4:11-CV-04500 LB

CLASS ACTION

21 Plaintiffs,

22 v.

24 **APPLE INC.; HACHETTE BOOK GROUP,  
INC.; HARPERCOLLINS PUBLISHERS,  
INC.; MACMILLAN PUBLISHERS, INC.;  
25 PENGUIN GROUP (USA) INC.; SIMON  
AND SCHUSTER, INC.; and DOES I-X,**

**ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO  
CONSIDER WHETHER CASES SHOULD  
BE RELATED [L.R. 3-12]**

27 Defendants.

1                   **TO ALL PARTIES AND THEIR COUNSEL OF RECORD:**  
 2

3                   PLEASE TAKE NOTICE that Plaintiff Eugenia Ruane-Gonzales submits this  
 4 Administrative Motion to relate *Ruane-Gonzales v. Apple, Inc. et al.*, Case No. 4:11-CV-04500  
 5 LB (“*Ruane-Gonzales*”), filed September 9, 2011 to *Petru et al. v. Apple, Inc. et al.*, Case No.  
 6 3:11-CV-03892 EMC (“*Petru*”), filed on August 9, 2011 pursuant to Civil Local Rule 3-12.

7                   **I. APPLICABLE STANDARD UNDER CIVIL L.R. 3-12**

8                   Under Civil Local Rule 3-12, an “action is related to another when: (1) the actions  
 9 concern substantially the same parties, property, transaction or event, and (2) it appears likely  
 10 that there will be an unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense or conflicting results if  
 11 the cases are conducted before different Judges.” Civil L.R. 3-12(a). Whenever a party knows or  
 12 believes that an action may be related to an action which is or was pending in the Northern  
 13 District, said party “must promptly file in the earliest-filed case an Administrative Motion to  
 14 Consider Whether Cases Should be Related, pursuant to civil L.R. 7-11.”<sup>1</sup> Civil L.R. 3-12(b).  
 15 That motion must include: “(1) The title and case number of each apparently related case; [and]  
 16 (2) A brief statement of the relationship of the actions according to the criteria set forth in Civil  
 17 L.R. 3-12(a).”

18                   **II. GONZALES AND PETRU ARE RELATED CASES**

19                   The *Petru* litigation was filed in this Court on August 9, 2011. The *Ruane-Gonzales*  
 20 litigation was filed on September 9, 2011 and was assigned Case No. 4:11-CV-04500 LB. These  
 21 two cases involve the exact same transactions and events, the identical defendants, similar  
 22 allegations and causes of action, and the same proposed class of plaintiffs. Accordingly, there  
 23

---

24  
 25  
 26                   <sup>1</sup> “In addition to complying with Civil L.R. 7-11, a copy of the motion, together with proof  
 27 of service pursuant to Civil L.R. 5-6, must be served on all known parties to each apparently  
 28 related action. A Chambers copy of the motion must be lodged with the assigned Judge in each  
 apparently related case under Civil L.R. 5-1(b).” Civil L.R. 3-12(b).

1 will be unduly burdensome duplication of labor and expense and there will be a risk of  
2 conflicting results if these cases are conducted with different Judges.  
3

4 **III. CONCLUSION**

5 *Ruane-Gonzales* and *Petru* satisfy the criteria of Civil Local Rule 3-12. Therefore,  
6 Plaintiff Eugenia Ruane-Gonzales respectfully requests that *Ruane-Gonzales* be deemed related  
7 to *Petru* and that *Ruane-Gonzales* be assigned to the Honorable Edward M. Chen, the Judge  
8 assigned to the low numbered case, *Petru*.  
9

10 DATED: October 4, 2011  
11

12  
13 By: \_\_\_\_\_  
14

15 Harry Shulman, Esq.  
16 **SHULMAN LAW**  
17 44 Montgomery Street, Suite 3830  
18 San Francisco, California 94104  
19 Telephone: (415) 901-0505  
Facsimile: (866) 422-4859  
[harry@shulmanlawfirm.com](mailto:harry@shulmanlawfirm.com)  
20

21 William H. London, Esq.  
Douglas A. Millen, Esq.  
22 **FREED KANNER LONDON & MILLEN LLC**  
23 2201 Waukegan Road, Suite 130  
Bannockburn, IL 60015  
24 Telephone: (224) 632-4500  
Facsimile: (224) 632-4519  
[blondon@fklmlaw.com](mailto:blondon@fklmlaw.com)  
25

26 Counsel for Plaintiffs  
27  
28